

"MANDATORY CHAMBERS COPY"

All future discovery filings shall include the following language on the cover page:
 "[Referred to Magistrate Judge Suzanne H. Segal]"

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA – WESTERN DIVISION

| | |
|---|---|
| ALMA SUMARAN, an individual, |) Case No.: 2:15-cv-02659-GW |
| PAMELA COLEMAN, an individual, |) (MAN) (SS-x) |
| |) |
| Plaintiffs, |) Assigned to Courtroom: 10 |
| |) The Hon. George H. Wu |
| vs. |) |
| GARDEN ESTATE APARTMENTS LLC, |) [PROPOSED] CONFIDENTIALITY |
| a California Limited Liability Company, |) ORDER |
| |) |
| Defendant. |) Action Commenced: 04/09/2015 |
| |) Trial Date: 04/05/2016 |
| |) Discovery Cut-Off: 12/08/2015 |
| |) Law & Motion Cut-Off: 02/22/2016 |

The parties having entered into a Stipulation for the entry of a Confidentiality Order to govern the disclosure, dissemination, and use of "Confidential Information" produced by the parties in this action, and the Court having reviewed the Stipulation and finding good cause for the entry of such an order, HEREBY ORDERS THAT:

CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION

1. Southern California Housing Rights Center ("HRC"), counsel for Plaintiff, contends that information regarding the investigative techniques used by

1 the HRC staff and information relating to any investigation carried out by the HRC
2 is confidential and the public disclosure of such information would jeopardize
3 ongoing and future investigation of other property owners' and would tax the
4 limited resources of the HRC by requiring them to continually find new
5 investigative techniques. Therefore, HRC seeks to designate documents related to
6 its investigative techniques as confidential. See *Shammouh v. Karp*, 1996 U.S.
7 Dist. LEXIS 16334 (E.D. Pa. Nov. 5, 1996) (holding good cause exists to treat
8 information regarding the identities of testers and investigative techniques as
9 confidential).

10 2. Parties also seek to designate as Confidential Information documents
11 pertaining to the ownership or operation of the subject properties, as well as the
12 financial and personal information pertaining to tenants, employees, or
13 independent contractors associated with the management of the subject properties.

14 3. Any documents or things produced in discovery that contain or reveal
15 Confidential Information or that are designated as Confidential Information under
16 the terms of the Order, and all copies, recordings, abstracts, excerpts, analyses,
17 court filings, or other writings that contain, reflect, reveal, suggest, or otherwise
18 disclose such Confidential Information shall be deemed to be Confidential
19 Information until and unless the court rules otherwise.

20 4. The provisions of the Order shall not apply to information which can
21 be shown by competent evidence to be: (i) in the public domain at the time of
22 disclosure or, through no fault of the Receiving Party, in the public domain after
23 the time of disclosure; (ii) known to or developed by the Receiving Party prior to
24 the time of disclosure; or (iii) obtained from a third party unrelated to the parties or
25 action and not within its employ.

26 DOCUMENTS

27 5. For the purposes of this Confidentiality Order, "Documents" means
28 all written, recorded, computerized, electronic, or graphical material or information

1 and things, whether produced or created by a Party or another person, and whether
2 produced in response to a discovery request, subpoena, agreement, or otherwise.

3 **PARTIES**

4 6. A "Disclosing Party" is the party who produces or discloses
5 Confidential Information, or on whose behalf such information is disclosed, to a
6 receiving party's attorneys. A "Receiving Party" is any party (either Plaintiff or a
7 defendant) that receives or is permitted to receive Confidential Information from
8 the Disclosing Party under the Order.

9 **DESIGNATION OF CONFIDENTIALITY**

10 7. Confidential Information shall be disclosed by the parties and their
11 counsel only in accordance with the terms of this Confidentiality Order and shall
12 be used solely for the purposes of this action and shall not be used by the parties or
13 their counsel for any other purpose. The following describes the procedure for
14 designating "Confidential Information" as "Confidential."

15 a. Confidential Information may be designated by a Disclosing
16 Party as "Confidential" by marking it as "Confidential" or by designating the
17 information as "Confidential" by any separate writing sufficient to identify the
18 information which is provided to the Receiving Party.

19 b. Where such designation is made by stamping or similar means,
20 it shall be made by placing notice on the document, thing, response to discovery,
21 deposition or court transcript or record, information, or document stored on
22 diskette or otherwise in computer usable form, or tangible thing or object, in such a
23 manner as will not interfere with the legibility or accessibility of the Confidential
24 Information.

25 c. Information and documents designated as "Confidential
26 Information" shall be subject to the disclosure restrictions of the Order. Any
27 Receiving Party or other person who receives a document so designated is subject
28

1 to this Confidentiality Order and the jurisdiction of the Central District of
2 California for enforcement of the Order.

3 d. If a party wishes to challenge the designation of a document or
4 portion of a document as "Confidential," the party challenging the designation
5 shall meet and confer in good faith with the designating party in an attempt to
6 resolve the dispute pursuant to Local Rule 37-1. If the parties are unable to resolve
7 their dispute, they agree to file a joint stipulation, including all issues in dispute
8 and the contentions and points of authorities of each party, prior to seeking
9 adjudication of the matter pursuant to Local Rule 37-2 and Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c).
10 Any motion challenging a confidential designation must be filed in strict
11 compliance with Local Rules 37-1 and 37-2 (including the Joint Stipulation
12 requirement). The party seeking confidentiality has the burden of establishing that
13 protection is warranted under Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c).

14 DISCLOSURE

15 8. Confidential Information disclosed by a Disclosing Party under the
16 Order shall be used by the Receiving Party only for purposes of this litigation and
17 not for any business, commercial, scientific, competitive, or other purpose
18 whatsoever.

19 9. Nothing in this Confidentiality Order shall be construed to impose
20 affirmative obligations on the Court or court personnel, who are subject only to the
21 Court's internal procedures regarding the handling of material filed or lodged
22 under seal. Confidential Information shall not be disclosed by the parties or their
23 counsel to anyone other than the Court and its officers, counsel and their agents
24 and employees, and the parties.

25 10. Counsel may disclose Confidential Information to qualified third-
26 parties employed or retained to assist in the prosecution, defense, or settlement of
27 this action, such as investigators, expert witnesses and technical advisers. Anyone
28 (other than the Court and its personnel) who is allowed to receive Confidential

1 Information shall be provided with a copy of this Confidentiality Order and shall
2 sign a Non-Disclosure Agreement in form set forth below or in a substantially
3 similar form before such disclosure is made:

4 Non-Disclosure Agreement

5 I, (name of individual), have read and fully understand the
6 Confidentiality Order dated (date), in the action *Sumaran, et al v.*
7 *Garden Estate Apartments, LLC*, in the United States District Court
8 for the Central District of California. I am familiar with and agree to
9 comply with and be bound by the provisions of said Order and submit
10 myself to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
11 Central District of California for any proceedings with respect to said
12 Confidentiality Order. I will not divulge to persons other than those
13 specifically authorized by said Order, or copy or use, except solely for
14 the purposes of this action, any material or information obtained
15 pursuant to said Order except as specifically permitted by the Court.

16 Dated: (Signature)

17 (Address)

18 (Telephone)

19 11. Confidential Information may be filed with the Court under seal only
20 by following the requirements set forth in Local Rule 79-5.

21 12. Prior to hearings or testimony before the Court in this case, the
22 parties, in the event that it is known reasonably in advance of such hearing or
23 testimony that matters involving "Confidential Information" will be raised, shall so
24 advise the Court.

25 **INADVERTENT DISCLOSURE**

26 13. In the event that a party discovers after they have produced
27 information that they have inadvertently failed to designate as "Confidential
28 Information," that was not designated as Confidential, the disclosing party may

1 designate the information as Confidential by a subsequent notice in writing
2 identifying the information and furnishing the correct designation, in which event
3 the parties shall henceforth treat such information as provided in the Order, and
4 shall undertake a best effort to retrieve any disclosure, dissemination, or use of
5 such information prior to re-designation.

6 **OTHER**

7 14. Nothing in this Confidentiality Order shall affect the admissibility of
8 any Confidential Information in this action. By producing the confidential
9 documents, producing Parties do not waive any objection to the confidential
10 documents' admissibility, relevance, or any other ground of objection, all of which
11 grounds are specifically reserved.

12 15. Within 30 days after the termination of this action all Confidential
13 Information produced by a party shall be returned to that party's counsel.

14 16. Nothing in this Confidentiality Order shall be construed to unduly
15 hamper the rights of the parties to prosecute and defend this action. The execution
16 of this Confidentiality Order shall not preclude any party from objecting to
17 discovery that it believes to be improper, from moving the Court for confidentiality
18 orders in the course of this litigation, or from moving for an order modifying or
19 expanding this Confidentiality Order as needed.

20 17. This Confidentiality Order shall survive the final termination of this
21 action. The Court shall retain jurisdiction to enforce this Confidentiality Order for
22 six months after the final termination to resolve any dispute concerning the use of
23 Confidential Information.

24 18. The parties to this agreement may exercise any rights they may have,
25 at law or in equity, to enforce its terms.

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1 IT IS SO ORDERED.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

8/14/15



Hon. Margaret A. Nagle
United States Magistrate Judge

SHANNE H. SEGAL